BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10083966 1

CONTRACTS
CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 2

Brian A. Lewis

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

1990-1991

These materials are reproduced solely for
the use of students in the Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

E
11
7
5
90
2

LAW LIBRARY
AUG 3 0 1990
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONTRACTS
CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 2

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

1990-1991

KF 801
A7 L35

These materials are reproduced solely for
the use of students in the Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/contractscasesma02lang_0

Table of Contents

Title Page.....i
Table of Contents.....ii

CHAPTER 1 AN OVERVIEW: Some Thoughts on Law and the Law of Contracts

A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism about Normalism".....1.1
R. Dworkin, Law's Empire.....1.2
Kronman & Posner, "Introduction: Economic Theory and Contract Law.....1.3
R. Heilbroner, The Making of Economic Society.....1.8
C. Fried, Contract As Promise.....1.13
P. Benson, "Abstract Right and the Possibility of a Nondistributive Conception of Contract: Hegel and Contemporary Contract Theory".....1.19
M. Sandel, Liberalism and the Limits of Justice.....1.27
P. Benson, "Abstract Right".....1.29
Questions.....1.36

CHAPTER 2 REMEDIES

2.1 DAMAGES

Wertheim v. Chicoutimi Pulp.....2.1.1
Peevyhouse v. Garland Coal & Mining.....2.1.1
Notes and Questions on Peevyhouse.....2.1.7
Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State and Utopia.....2.1.8
Harris, Ogus & Phillips, "Contract Remedies and the Consumer Surplus".....2.1.12
Hawkins v. McGee.....2.1.16
Bush v. Canfield.....2.1.19
Acme Mills & Elevator v. Johnson.....2.1.23
Restatement of The Law of Contract s.90.....2.1.26
Anglia Television v. Reed.....2.1.27
A.I. Ogus, "Damages For Pre-Contractual Expenditure".....2.1.29
Bowlay Logging v. Domtar.....2.1.30
Posner, Economic Analysis of Law.....2.1.33
A.M. Polinsky, "Breach of Contract".....2.1.34
I. Macneil, "Efficient Breach of Contract: Circles in the Sky".....2.1.44
D. Friedmann, "The Efficient Breach Fallacy".....2.1.47
Dworkin, Law's Empire.....2.1.56
Deglman v. Guarantee Trust.....2.1.57
Moses v. Macferlan.....2.1.60

2.2 PENALTY CLAUSES, FORFEITURE CLAUSES, AND LIQUIDATED DAMAGES

S. Rea, "Efficiency Implications of Penalties and Liquidated Damages".....2.2.1
Stockloser v. Johnson.....2.2.13
H.F. Clarke Ltd. v. Thermidaire Corp.....2.2.21
Shatilla v. Feinstein.....2.2.32

2.3 SPECIFIC PERFORMACE

R.J. Sharpe, Studies in Contract Law.....2.3.1
Warner Brothers PIctures Inc. v. Nelson.....2.3.2
Kronman, "Specific Performance".....2.3.7
Schwartz, "The Case for Specific Performance".....2.3.12
Brown, "Contract Remedies in a Planned Economy: Labour Arbitration Leads the Way".....2.3.17
Wroth v. Tyler.....2.3.22
Behnke v. Bede Shipping Co.....2.3.29

2.4 REMOTENESS/FORESEEABILITY

Hadley v. Baxendale.....2.4.1
Danzig, "Hadley v. Baxendale: A Study in the Industrialization of the Law".....2.4.3
Fuller & Eisenberg, Basic Contract Law.....2.4.5
Atiyah, The Rise and Fall of Freedom of Contract.....2.4.8
Victoria Laundry v. Newman Industries.....2.4.9
Koufos v. Czarnikow (The Heron II).....2.4.15
Cornwall Gravel v. Purolator Courier Ltd.....2.4.22

2.5 INTANGIBLE INJURIES

Addis v. Gramophone Co.....2.5.1
Jarvis v. Swans Tours Ltd.....2.5.4
Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity".....2.5.7
Vorvis v. Insurance Corporation of British Columbia.....2.5.13

2.6 MITIGATION

White and Carter (Councils) v. McGregor.....2.6.1
Asamera Oil Corp. v. Sea Oil & General Corp.....2.6.9
Finelli v. Dee.....2.6.18
Payzu Ltd. v. Saunders.....2.6.20

CHAPTER 3 THE THRESHOLD OF ENFORCEABILITY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Fuller, "Consideration and Form".....3.1.1

M.A. Eisenberg, "The Bargain Principle and Its Limits"....3.1.20
Christie v. York Corporation.....3.1.26
R. Unger, "The Critical Legal Studies Movement".....3.1.36
Lac Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd...3.1.40

3.2 BARGAIN THEORY

C. Fried, Contract As Promise.....3.2.1
C. Dalton, "Deconstructing Contract Doctrine".....3.2.8
White v. Bluett.....3.2.10
Hohfeld, "Fundamental Legal Conceptions" Chart.....3.2.11
Thomas v. Thomas.....3.2.12
Hamer v. Sidway.....3.2.14
Milner, Huck Finn reference.....3.2.16
Dalhousie College v. Boutilier Estate.....3.2.17
Milner, "Note on the History of Consideration".....3.2.26
Fuller & Eisenberg, "Note on the History of Contract in the Common Law".....3.2.28
Great Northern Railway Co. v. Witham.....3.2.35
Schnell v. Nell.....3.2.38
Greenberg v. Lake Simcoe Ice Supply Co.....3.2.40
Tobias v. Dick T. Eaton Co.....3.2.43
Wood v. Lucy, Lady Duff-Gordon.....3.2.44
M.J. Frug, "Re-Reading Contracts: A Feminist Analysis of a Contracts Casebook".....3.2.45

3.3 PAST CONSIDERATION

Lampleigh v. Brathwait.....3.3.1
Roscorla v. Thomas.....3.3.2
Poa On v. Lau Yiu Long.....3.3.3
Note on Infants' Contracts and the Effect of the Statute of Limitations.....3.3.6

3.4 COMPROMISES

Cook v. Wright.....3.4.1
Alliance Bank v. Broom.....3.4.3
Fairgrief v. Ellis.....3.4.5

3.5 INTENTION TO CREATE LEGAL RELATIONS

Weeks v. Tybald.....3.5.1
Balfour v. Balfour.....3.5.1
Jones v. Padavatton.....3.5.5
Upton-On-Severn Rural District Council v. Powell.....3.5.11
R. Unger, "The Critical Legal Studies Movement".....3.5.13
C. Dalton, "Deconstructing Contract Doctrine".....3.5.15

3.6 RELIANCE

Fuller & Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages".....3.6.1
Harris v. Watson.....3.6.10
Stilk v. Myrick.....3.6.11
Smith v. Dawson.....3.6.12
Firm Offer Note.....3.6.13
Eisenberg, "Donative Promises".....3.6.15
Posner, "Gratuitous Promises in Economics and Law".....3.6.28
Gilbert Steel Ltd. v. University Constructions Ltd.....3.6.33
Wishing Well.....3.6.37
Aivazian, Trebilcock & Penny, "The Law of Contract Modifications: The Uncertain Quest for a Bench Mark of Enforceability".....3.6.38
Owen Sound Public Library Board v. Mail Developments Ltd..3.6.60
Foakes v. Beer.....3.6.66
Bank of Nova Scotia v. MacLennan.....3.6.69
Note on Dive v. Maningham.....3.6.71
Hughes v. Metropolitan Ry. Co.....3.6.72
Central London Property Trust Ltd. v. High Trees House Ltd.....3.6.79
Combe v. Combe.....3.6.83
Imperator Realty Co. v. Tull.....3.6.86
D.& C. Builders v. Rees.....3.6.89
Crabb v. Arun District Council.....3.6.93
Loranger v. Haines.....3.6.99

3.7 UNILATERAL CONTRACTS

Carill v. Carbolic Smoke Ball Co.....3.7.1
Errington v. Errington.....3.7.5
Dawson v. Helicopter Exploration Co.....3.7.6

3.8 MISREPRESENTATION & MATERIAL NON-DISCLOSURE

Heilbut, Symons v. Buckleton.....3.8.1
Redgrave v. Hurd.....3.8.7
Leaf v. Internationsl Galleries.....3.8.15
Murray v. Sperry Rand.....3.8.17
Ranger v. Herbert A. Watts (Quebec) Ltd.....3.8.21
Hedley Byrne v. Heller.....3.8.22
Esso Petroleum Co. v. Mardon.....3.8.27
Nunes Diamonds v. Dominion Electric Co.....3.8.30
Note re: Yanni v. Edwin Evans & Sons.....3.8.39

CHAPTER 4 CONTRACT FORMATION

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Note on The Seal.....4.1.1

Fuller, "Consideration and Form".....4.1.2

4.2 OBJECTIVE THEORY

Grant v. Province of New Brunswick.....4.2.1
Smith v. Hughes.....4.2.6
Hobbes v. Esquimault & Nanaimo Ry. Co.....4.2.12
Bell v. Lever Bros Ltd.....4.2.15
Greenberg v. Meffert et al.....4.2.16
C. Dalton, "Deconstructing Contract Doctrine".....4.2.21

4.3 UNSIGNED DOCUMENTS

Parker v. South Eastern Railway.....4.3.1
Ollie v. Marlborough COurt.....4.3.9
Thornton v. Shoe Lane Parking.....4.3.10
A Ticket Case.....4.3.14
J. Spurling v. Bradshaw.....4.3.15
McCutcheon v. MacBrayne Ltd.....4.3.16
British Crane Hire v. Ispwich Plant Hire.....4.3.20

4.4 RULES

Harvey v. Facey.....4.4.1
Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain v. Boots Cash Chemists (Southern) Ltd.....4.4.3
Fisher v. Bell.....4.4.5
H.L.A. Hart, The Concept of Law.....4.4.7
Shatford v. B.C. Wine Growers Ltd.....4.4.8
Hyde v. Wrench.....4.4.9
Household Insurance Co. v. Grant.....4.4.10
Henthorn v. Fraser.....4.4.15
K.N. Llewellin on the Rules of Offer and Acceptance.....4.4.17

4.5 BATTLE OF THE FORMS

Butler Machine Tool Co. v. Ex-Cell-O Corp (England) Ltd.....4.5.1
R. Unger, "The Critical Legal Studies Movement".....4.5.6

4.6 UNCERTAINTY ETC.

May and Butcher Ltd. v. R.....4.6.1
Hillas and Co. v. Arcos Ltd.....4.6.3
Bristol, Cardiff, and Swansea Aerated Breach Co. v. Maggs.....4.6.8
Bellamy v. Debenham.....4.6.11
Foley v. Classique Coaches Ltd.....4.6.12
Calvan Consolidated Oil & Gas Ltd. v. Manning.....4.6.13
Canada Square Corp. v. Versafood Services Ltd.....4.6.20
R. Gordon, "Macaulay, MacNeil, and the Discovery of Solidarity

and Power in Contract Law".....4.6.42

4.7 DUTY TO BARGAIN

Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woolen Co.....4.7.1
Courteney and Fairbairn Ltd. v. Tolaini Brothers (Hotels) Ltd.....4.7.3
Hoffman v. Red Owl Stores.....4.7.6
William Lacey Ltd. v. Davis.....4.7.10
Brewer v. Chrysler.....4.7.11

4.8 REASONABLE INTERPRETATION / PAROLE EVIDENCE RULE

Hawrish v. Bank of Montreal.....4.8.1
Gallen v. Allstate Grain.....4.8.5
Law Reform Commission Recommendations.....4.8.15
Corbin on Contracts, Parole Evidence "Rule".....4.8.16
Bauer v. Bank of Montreal.....4.8.19
Stanley Fish, "The Law Wishes To Have a Formal Existence".4.8.33
C. Dalton, "Deconstructing Contract Doctrine".....4.8.35
Stanley Fish, "The Law Wishes..."....4.8.39
Wittgenstein, "Philosophical Investigations".....4.8.42
Chaffee, "The Disorderly Conduct of Words".....4.8.43

CHAPTER 5 PERFORMANCE AND BREACH

Sale of Goods Act R.S.O. 1980 Chapter 462.....5.1
Cehave N.V. v. Bremer.....5.2
Arcos v. Ronaasen.....5.11
Boone v. Eyre.....5.16
Gary Larson, "A Fudnamental Breach".....5.17
Hong Kong Fir Shipping Co. v. Kawasaki Kisen Kaisha, Ltd.....5.18
Howe v. Smith.....5.23
Dies v. British International Mining and Finance Corp.....5.25

CHAPTER 6 THIRD PARTIES

Midland Silicones Ltd. v. Scruttons Ltd.....6.1
New Zealand Shipping Co. v. A.M. Satterthwaite & Co.....6.3
Port Jackson Stevedoring Pty Ltd. v. Salmon & Spraeger (Australia) Pty Ltd. (The New York Star).....6.8
Greenwood Shopping Plaza v. Beattie.....6.13
ITO - International Terminal Operators Ltd. v. Miida Electronics Inc.....6.21
Jackson v. Horizon Holidays Ltd.....6.37
Beswick v. Beswick.....6.40
R. Howse, "Attachments by Choice: Liberalism and the Problem of Community".....6.52

CHAPTER 7 MISTAKEN IDENTITY

Boulton v. Jones.....7.1
Cundy v. Lindsay.....7.2
King's Norton Metal v. Edridge.....7.6
Phillips v. Brooks.....7.7
Ingram v. Little.....7.11
Lewis v. Averay.....7.20

CHAPTER 8 DOCUMENTS MISTAKENLY SIGNED - NON EST FACTUM

Saunders v. Anglia Building Society (Gallie v. Lee).....8.1
Prudential Trust v. Cugnet.....8.13
Marvco Colour Research v. Harris.....8.22

CHAPTER 9 MISTAKE

Raffles v. Wichelhaus.....9.1
Grant Gilmore, The Death of Contract.....9.2
Henkel v. Pape.....9.7
A. Kronman, "Mistake, Disclosure, Information and the Law of Contracts (Includes Laidlaw v. Organ).....9.9
Bell v. Lever Bros.....9.15
Solle v. Butcher.....9.23
Sherwood v. Walker (Rose 2d of Aberone).....9.30
T.D. Bank v. Fortin (No.2).....9.35
Magee v. Pennine Insurance Co.....9.39
McRae v. Commonwealth Disposals Commission.....9.42
C. Fried, Contract As Promise.....9.53

CHAPTER 10 FRUSTRATION

Wittgenstein, "Philosophical Investigations".....10.1
Paradine v. Jane.....10.2
Taylor v. Caldwell.....10.3
Howell v. Coupland.....10.6
Snipes Mountain v. Benz Bros.....10.9
Parrish & Heimbecker v. Gooding Lumber.....10.11
Krell v. Henry.....10.14
Davis Contractors v. Fareham Urban District Council.....10.21
Tsakiroglou v. Noblee Thorl.....10.25
Amalgamated Investment v. John Walker.....10.31
Capital Quality Homes v. Colwyn Construction.....10.35
Posner & Rosenfield, "Impossibility and Related Doctrines in Contract Law: An Economic Analysis".....10.46
Appleby v. Myers.....10.55
Fibrosa Spolka Akcyjna v. Fairbairn Lawson Combe Barbour....10.58
Frustrated Contracts Act, R.S.O 1980, c.179.....10.68

CHAPTER 11 THE LIMITS OF THE CONTRACT PRINCIPLE

11.1 OVERVIEW

Christie v. York.....see 3.1.26
Post v. Jones.....11.1.1
Gilmore, "The Ages of American Law.....11.1.3
Lochner v. New York.....11.1.4
Hurley v. Eddingfield.....11.1.9
Toker v. Westerman.....11.1.10
A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism About Normalism".....11.1.12
Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State and Utopia.....see 2.1.8
Milton Friedman, Capitalism and Freedom.....11.1.14
C.B. MacPherson, "Elegant Tombstones: A Note on Friedman Freedom".....11.1.16
Two Quotations.....11.1.18
D. Kennedy, "Form and Substance in Private Law Adjudication".....11.1.19
R. Posner, The Economics of Justice.....11.1.26
Scanlon, "Liberty, Contract and Contribution".....11.1.28
Alchain and Allen, University Economics.....11.1.29
Rawls, A Theory of Justice.....11.1.30
A.T. Kronman, "Contract Law and Distributive Justice".....11.1.31
A.A. Leff, "Unconscionability and the Code - The Emperor's New Clause".....11.1.38

11.2 EXEMPTION CLAUSES / "FUNDAMENTAL BREACH"

Canadian Dominion Leasing Corp v. Suburban Superdrug.....11.2.1
Harbutt's Plasticine v. Wayne Tank Co.....11.2.7
Canso Chemicals Ltd. v. Canadian Westinghouse.....11.2.14
Photo Production Ltd. v. Securicor Transport Ltd.....11.2.22
Gallen v. Allstate Grain.....see 4.6.5
Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncrude Canada Ltd.....11.2.29
Geo Mitchell v. Finney Lock Seeds.....11.2.54

11.3 UNCONSCIONABILITY

Henningsen v. Bloomfield Motors.....11.3.1
Marshall v. Canada Permanent Trust.....11.3.10
Mundinger v. Mundinger.....11.3.15
Lloyds Bank v. Bundy.....11.3.19
National West Bank Pk. v. Morgan.....11.3.25
Tilden Rent-A-Car v. Clendenning.....11.3.28
Pridmore v. Calvert.....11.3.36
Macaulay v. Schroeder Music Publishing Co.....11.3.40
McKenzie v. Bank of Montreal.....11.3.48
Canadian Kawasaki Motors Ltd. v. McKenzie.....11.3.53
Sale of Goods Act.....11.3.62
Consumer Protection Act.....11.3.63
Business Practices Act.....11.3.65